First session:
Framing the health risks on raw milk cheese with norms and regulations?
*A crossed perspectives analysis*

June 2016, the 29&30th

AgroParisTech Amphithéâtre René Dumont
16 rue Claude Bernard, 75006 - Paris

This is the first of three separate days of a structured seminar organised by the REPASTOL program « Re-examining pasteurisation ». This international and multi-disciplinary research program runs over two years (2016-2017) and supports, defends and promotes the need to reevaluate the impact of pasteurization and its alternatives including hygienic, but also technical, social and economic aspects.

This first session is devoted to the regulation aspects, from their conception, their international tuning, their adaptation to production situations and their control. It tries to echo the many difficulties raised by the microbiological security legal framing.

- Oct-Nov 2016: Micro-organisms: Micro-organisms: objects and subjects of rights? To be held in Bourg en Bresse (France)
- May 2017: The controversies on the milk agrifood systems governance

This seminar is open to researchers, cheese production and retail professionals, public administration… Please send your registration demand to Marie-Christine Montel marie-christine.montel@clermont.inra.fr, William Van Caenegem <wvancaen@bond.edu.au> or Geneviève Teil genevieve.teil@agroparistech.fr

The communications will be either in French or English, according to the speaker’s preferences. The projected slides will be in the alternative language so as to help for everyone’s understanding. Questions and answers can be made as well in French or English.

---

1 The REPASTOL program is financed by GLOFOODS, an INRA Cirad metaprogramme
| Time     | Session 1: Norms and regulations in the making: The food safety norms and regulations their stakes, their issues, their arbitrations A multinational and international perspective June 29th | Suggested topics and issues                                                                 | program of contributions                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 9H30-11H15 | **Introduction:** The structure of the regulatory authorities  
**1.1 The international framework and harmonisation of national regulations. Discussions on the Codex Alimentarius and the WTO.**  
• A general exploration but with focus on milk, and on the difficulties and interests in international harmonization: competition, hygiene and health, health risks and bacterial contamination. | **1H45**  
• [5’] Repastol team  
• Erik Millstone (SPRU Sussex) ‘The evolution of the food safety policy regimes of the EU and Codex and their relevance to raw milk and unpasteurised milk products’ [30’]  
• Maryvonne Lasalle de Salins, AgroParisTech (Massy-France) The international regulations as they are made: the elaboration of the Codex norms. [30’] |
|          | **pause**                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 11H30-13H00 | **1.2. The process for determination of regulations against health risks in raw milk cheese**  
**a. Negotiations and problems with international harmonisation**  
• The history of the debate concerning raw milk (e.g. the agreement of 1999: compulsory pasteurization v pasteurization, the solution ultimately agreed upon)  
• European hygiene pack drafting and working out  
**b. Crossed perspectives on**  
• Escherichia coli, shigatoxines, traditional materials | **1H30**  
**1.2. The process for determination of regulations against health risks in raw milk cheese**  
**a. Negotiations and problems with international harmonisation**  
• Frédéric Blanchard, Yolande Moulem, Farmhouse and Artisan Cheese & Dairy Producers European Network - FACE network, Adapting the regulation to the “fermier” [farm] production: the evolutions of the “fermier” hygienic good practices guide.  
**b. Crossed perspectives**  
• On wood: V. Michel (EU) et C. Donelly (USA)  
• *E. coli*: V. Michel (EU) et C. Donelly (USA) |
<p>|          | <strong>Lunch 13H00-14H00</strong>                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session 2: Norms put to the test of cheese making process</th>
<th>2.1. Problems with the implementation of regulations in different countries. Analysis of problems concerning:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 14H00-14H40 | c. Risk analysis methodology                                                                                      | • Sanitary risk analysis & assessment  
• The sanitary risk « unacceptability » for e.g. emerging risks  
• Scientific controversies of measures and measurement of STEC risks, a very apt example.  
• Risk evaluation, the inclusion of the customers point of view |
| 14H45-16H15 | 2.1. Problems with the implementation of regulations in different countries. Analysis of problems concerning: | • The issue of monitoring and controls, what can be monitored and the existing limits on controls and inspections  
• The accompaniment by intermediary structures: interprofessional groups, ONGs, technician networks  
• Prohibition, monitoring and delegation: confidence or otherwise in the various actors to manage risk  
• Hygiene at what costs: what is at stake with hierarchical classification of risk.  
• … |
| 16H30-17H45 | 2.2. Crisis situations, a different evaluation and management of new risks | • The difficult balance between prevention and cure  
• Risk and crisis management |
| 1H30 | 2.1. Problems with the implementation of regulations in different countries. | • Mayra Bertussi, The federal law, the departmental laws and the artisanal cheese producers in Brazil. The role or the intermediary structures, NGOs and expert networks in the negotiation of the norms regarding the artisanal production  
• W. van Caenegam and Madeline Taylor (Bond University, Brisbane) : ‘The new Australian regulations for Raw Milk Cheese: a real change or NO business as usual’  
• B. Percival (Neal’s Yard Dairy, anthropologist) Pasteurisation and Protectionism? The Case of Stilton Cheese |
| 1H15 | 2.2. Crisis situations, a different evaluation and management of new risks | • Marie Pierre Donguy, The European alert network and crisis management  
• Marie Annick DYE. Crisis management and crisis consequences management. The MUS, the European crisis management network. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session 3: Two much safety?</th>
<th>3. Two much safety?</th>
<th>3. Two much safety?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 30th, 9H00-10H30</td>
<td>Summary introduction including an inventory of the difficulties, controversies and problems from norms tuning up to the regulation application</td>
<td>M. Chentouf (CRRA INRA Maroc), M. Mariani (INRA – Innov), G. Teil (INRA – IFP, Paris-Chennai (Inde), Larbi Toukour (CRRA INRA Maroc) et Said Zantar, (CRRA INRA Maroc) The traditional fresh cheese production in Northern Morocco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>J.-L. Angot (Président de la section &quot;Prospective, société, international&quot; du Conseil général de l’alimentation, de l’agriculture et des espaces ruraux (CGAAER))</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.1. Retailing and market demands: French and US-UK viewpoints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>UK-US &amp; French views on retailment and market demand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The customer demands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- The private certifications BRC, IFC, WBC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.1. Retailing and market demands: French and US-UK viewpoints</td>
<td>Volume retailing and market demands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Cathy Strange (Wholefoods US)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Severine Fontaine, Fresh produce, quality manager, (Carrefour France)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pause</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 3.2. Large and smaller producers’ from different countries points of view

- Large and small producers from
  - France
  - Belgium
  - Morocco
  - UK
  - …

- Daniel Cloots (Fromagerie du Gros Chêne & GIE of the Raw milk cheese producers) The demand for an always increased sanitary security.
- Stéfania Carpino (Dce du CORFILAC, Italie), 'Quality and law regulation for the traditional Sicilian raw milk cheeses.'
- Bernard Robert, Directeur de la coopérative jeune montagne au lait cru. 40 years experience on chesse making.

### Lunch 12H30-14H00

**Session 4 : Debate**

Towards a research consortium leading an international research project

**4. Towards better tuned regulations?**

**Discussions opening**

- Better management of a more correctly evaluated risk level. Towards better…
  - Education, certification of milk producers?
  - Good practice and derogations: for heating for some and for raw milk use for others?
- Towards a large international research program
  - Which are the pertinent research questions whether technical, economical, social, political… regarding regulation and microbes to go into ?
  - Which partners for the next phase of the REPASTOL Program ?

**2H00 4. Towards better tuned regulations and a next research step of the REPASTOL program**

**Summary of the main points and discussions opening**